

455 Golden Gate Ave., 10th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102
Phone (415) 403-4920
FAX (415) 703-5477

STATE OF CALIFORNIA
DEPARTMENT OF INDUSTRIAL
RELATIONS
DIVISION OF APPRENTICESHIP
STANDARDS

AUDIT REPORT
For

**Associated Builders and Contractors of
San Diego, Inc. Sheet Metal,
Plumbing/Pipefitting and Electrical
Unilateral Apprenticeship Committees
File numbers 19821, 19814, 19224**

The Division of Apprenticeship (DAS) Mission Statement creates opportunities for Californians to gain employable lifetime skills and provides employers with a highly skilled and experienced workforce while strengthening California's economy

CONTENTS

Summary.....	3
Findings and Recommendations.....	3
Audit Highlights/Introduction/Background.....	4
Scope/Focus/Methodology.....	5
Audit Results and Recommendations.....	6
Comments from Program Sponsor.....	15
Correction and Timeline.....	15
Remarks.....	15

SUMMARY

The Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) presents its audit report for the Associated Builders and Contractors of San Diego, Inc. Sheet Metal, Plumbing/Pipefitting and Electrical Unilateral Apprenticeship Committee programs; DAS file numbers 19821, 19814, and 19824, (hereafter the "programs"). The Sheet Metal program was selected for audit due to graduation rates that fall below the fifty percent (50%) average graduation rate for the Sheet Metal Industry. The Plumbing/Pipefitting and Electrical programs were selected at random. The three programs were audited as one. The audit was performed during August of 2007 and was conducted pursuant to California Labor Code §3073.1.

	Number of Apprentices	Number Audited	Graduation % comparison
Sheet Metal	35	10	47.81%
Plumbing/Pipefitting	78	16	56.45%
Electrical	315	77	75.58%

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

As noted in the detailed report which follows, the audit team did not find any program deficiencies. The San Diego ABC Programs meet or exceed all apprenticeship legal requirements. The Programs are exemplary with regard to their file and record keeping systems and execution of the programs in general.

The auditor found that the programs have excellent, well documented processes and procedures in place to facilitate the selection, indenture, and training of all apprentices, and the programs follow the procedures consistently with a focus on continuous improvement.

The attention to detail, one-on-one interaction with the apprentices and the enthusiastic dedication of the professional staff help to make these programs successful.

Detailed findings are included in the following report. No formal recommendations which require follow-up were made. During the course of the audit only a few minor discrepancies were noted and immediately corrected by staff. Staff welcomed the opportunity to discuss any findings which would result in positive growth.

Congratulations to the ABC program staff on their demonstrated commitment to excellence and their focus on continuous improvement.

INTRODUCTION/BACKGROUND

AUDIT HIGHLIGHTS.....

Our review of the Associated Builders and Contractors Sheet Metal, Plumbing/Pipefitting and Electrical programs; Division of Apprenticeship Standards (DAS) file number 19821, 19814 and 19824, (hereafter "Programs") found that:

- ☒ Our review found that the programs routinely update their Program Standards.
- ☒ The program requires all apprentices to sign and confirm that they understand the programs Rules and Regulations. The apprentice files contained signed copies of this document.
- ☒ The number of registered apprentices for these programs was correct.
- ☒ The program files did contain consistent verifiable OJT work hours. The apprentice is required to complete a work sheet to track work processes and OJT work hours.

Continued on next page....

On August 27 and 28, 2007, the auditor(s) met with key administrative personnel, examined records, observed administrative activities, and conducted a walk-through of the training facility. A subsequent job site visit was also conducted in connection with the audit. The Programs funding mechanism comes from a separate apprenticeship trust fund that holds income from employer contributions and Montoya funds.

The Daily operations, management and administrative functions are run by professional staff headed by the Director of Education, Tracey Barrett and full-time Coordinators, Ann Baay and Nicole Lieu. In addition, the Programs have 19 part-time instructors and a full time Training Facilities Manager.

Employers are approved to train when they have completed an Agreement to Train Apprentices, DAS-7 form, and that form is approved by the Committee. Prior to dispatching apprentices, employers must attend a mandatory orientation session which lasts about 3 hours.

Currently, the apprenticeship program provides a training program for the following occupations:

Name of Occupation	Term of Apprenticeship	Number of Apprentices
Sheet Metal	48 months	35
Plumbing/Pipefitting	48 months	78
Electrical (Inside wireman)	48 months	315
Electronic Systems Technician (EST was not audited)	36 months	28

San Diego City College is the Apprenticeship Program's Local Education Agency (LEA).

The Sheet Metal Apprenticeship is a 48 month program. Apprentices meeting the required advancement criteria progress through eight upgrade steps until completion. Training consists of 180 hours of related and supplemental training per year and 6500 hours of accumulated on-the-job training.

The Plumbing/Pipefitting Apprenticeship is a 48 month program. Apprentices meeting the required advancement criteria progress through four upgrade steps until completion. Training consists of 200 hours of related and supplemental training per year and 7,200 hours of accumulated on-the-job training.

The Electrical Apprenticeship is a 48 month program. Apprentices meeting the required advancement criteria progress through eight upgrade steps until completion. Training consists of 180 hours of related and supplemental training per year and 8,000 hours of accumulated on-the-job training.

SCOPE AND FOCUS

- ☑ Apprentice program files contain records of Required Supplemental Instruction (RSI) for classroom hours, attendance and grades.
- ☑ The job site visit was unable to confirm that the apprentices are keeping track of their on-the-job training hours. Only one apprentice had the record sheets with them at the time of the visit.

The principal objectives of the audit are to ensure the program is complying with their standards, that all on-the-job training is performed under the supervision of a journeyman, that all related and supplemental instruction required by the apprenticeship standards is being provided, that all work processes in the apprenticeship standards are being covered, and that graduates have completed the apprenticeship programs' requirements.

The audit focused on reviewing records and activities that tend to support and substantiate the programs' efforts, practices, system and capabilities to provide and deliver the on-the-job training and related instruction. The programs' policies and procedures were reviewed to determine if they support the programs' approved standards.

METHODOLOGY

After completing an initial review of the programs' standards and records on file with the DAS, an audit plan was established with the following steps:

1. Notified the program 14 days in advance of our intent to audit.
2. Prepare an entrance interview
3. Organization of all working paper to conduct the interview
4. Confirm the location where records are maintained
5. Conduct a review of all apprentice files
6. Set the time and date of the meeting
7. Schedule inspection of the training facility and job sites
8. Request and review copies of the committee meeting minutes for the last 12 months.

All steps listed above were accomplished and include interviews with primary staff, apprentices and job site supervisors.

AUDIT RESULTS

1. STANDARDS

The objective is to determine whether the programs are submitting periodic revisions to their standards and if standards are reasonably current. "Standards" are a written document containing all terms and conditions for the qualification, recruitment, selection, employment and training, working conditions, wages, employee benefits and other compensation for apprentices. It may also include other provisions and statements. All apprenticeship programs are required to submit their apprenticeship standards to the DAS Chief for approval. The California Code of Regulations states the program must submit revisions to its standards when necessary.

(a) Findings

- (1) The Sheet Metal, Plumbing/Pipefitting, and Electrical Programs had complete revisions in 9/1998, 10/98 and 5/00 respectively. Updated revisions (DAS 24s) are submitted on a regular basis as recently as 5/29/07

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Continue to review and update standards as needed.

Article IV (5) of the program's standards, Section 205 (f), 212 (a)(6) (7), (c)(2) (11) of the California Code of Regulations states that the program sponsor must submit revisions to its standards when necessary.

2. RULES AND REGULATIONS

The objective is to determine if the programs have adequate rules and regulations, are implementing them as required, and provide a copy to the apprentices. The rules and regulations can be defined as an orientation or workshop session that explains the apprenticeship program standards and the operation of the apprenticeship program. It includes information on what is expected by both the program and the apprentice. The program sponsor has adopted rules and regulations specific to their program showing responsibilities of the apprentice and the committee. At the time of enrollment into the program the apprentices are given an orientation and given a handout which contains a description of the work, equipment and tools used, working conditions, a description of the program, and the rules and regulations of the apprenticeship committee.

Apprentices attend a mandatory orientation meeting where they receive a copy of the rules and regulations and review the program standards. The meeting lasts about three hours and the apprentices sign a receipt indicating that they have received a copy of the rules and regulations. ABC staff track class attendance, grades, OJT hours and monitor for violations of the rules and regulations. Apprentices who are not following the rules and regulations are cited to appear before the Committee where they receive corrective and/or disciplinary action.

(a) Findings

- (1) This review found that the apprentice files contained signed copies to show that the apprentice had received, read, or understood this document.
- (2) The rules and regulations are reviewed by the Committee and updated if needed. The Committees apply the rules and regulations in a fair and consistent manner. Actions taken by the Committee are reflected in the meeting minutes and apprenticeship files.

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Continue enforcing the rules and regulations in a fair and consistent manner.

Article VI (2) of the program's standards, Section 3071, 3073, and Section 212 (a) (6) (7), (c) (2) (3) (8), (14) of the California Code of Regulations states that the program must establish rules and regulations that govern the program.

3. ACTIVE APPRENTICES AND CANCELLATIONS

The review of this item is to determine if the program is monitoring apprentices as they enter and proceed through the program. It is also to determine if the program is maintaining accurate records on both the active and cancelled apprentices. The program should have the ability to provide evidence of procedures used for periodic reviews and evaluation of the apprentice's progress in job performance and related instruction and maintenance of appropriate progress records. In addition, the program should have a process in place to notify the DAS when an apprentice leaves the program.

A review of the apprentice records reflected that overall apprentice records are well maintained.

(a) Findings

- (1) Prior to the audit the programs' files were reconciled with the DAS apprentice list.
-

- (2) ABC staff consistently track apprentices' status as they move through a program. Extensive out-of-work lists are kept along with release records. Upon release from a job, employers are required to submit an evaluation for the apprentices, and the apprentice is required to report to ABC for drug testing. OJT hours are entered into a data base that tracks accumulated hours. Through this process, staff can determine if an apprentice is falling behind in hours or is otherwise out of sync with classroom hours. Discrepancies are brought to the attention of the Committee for discussion and/or action. Cancellations are immediately sent to the DAS consultant where they are held for a 30 day appeal period before processing.
- (3) The files contained all employer evaluations, support documents for upgrades, and advancement documents.

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Continue their monitoring and notification system.

Section 205 (a)(1)(2) (i), 212 (a)(6) (7)(8), (b)(9), (c)(2)(10) 224 of the California Code of Regulations states that the program sponsor must maintain accurate apprenticeship records and submit changes, updates and revisions of an apprentice's status when necessary.

4. ON-THE-JOB TRAINING (OJT) PROGRESS RECORDS, ADVANCEMENTS AND EVALUATIONS

Our review is to determine if apprentices are progressing on schedule, that the program is maintaining adequate OJT records, receiving periodic evaluations and if the program has adequate records and a system in place to ensure that apprentices are covering all the work processes.

The program uses the following items to track apprentice's schedule, OJT records, periodic evaluations and work processes:

- The apprentice is provided with a monthly sheet to record their on-the-job training. The sheet contains a daily and monthly log for hours worked in the appropriate work process, instructions for completion, a place for the supervisors' remarks on the apprentices' progress and signature of the supervisor. Work processes are listed on the back.
- RSI hours and attendance are tracked separately in a data base from instructors' records.

(a) Findings

- (1) For the most part, OJT records were complete and up to date. Apprentices who weren't current had already received letters of notification or had been cited to appear before the Committee.
-

- (2) A review of the OJT sheets indicated that apprentices are covering all the work processes appropriate for their period.
- (3) OJT hours and RSI hours are both tracked through a data system. This allows staff to monitor progression through the periods. If discrepancies are noted, they are brought to the attention of the Committee for discussion and or action.
- (4) The audit revealed apprentices to be on track and progressing on schedule.

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Continue to cite apprentices who do not report OJT hours in accordance with the rules and regulations.

Section XVII of the program's standards, and Section 3073.1, 3076, 3078(e) of the Labor Code, and Sections 208, 210, 212(a) (4) (5) (7) (8), (b) (9), (c) (2) (6) (8) (9) (16) (18), of the California Code of Regulations. The program must offer training and supervision in all the work processes defined in its standards and has a system to ensure that apprentices cover all the work processes. The program must have a system of documenting and maintaining records that will assist in the review and evaluation of the apprentice's progress in job performance. The program must have a procedure for recording and maintaining accurate records, and a procedure for periodic review and evaluation of progress.

5. RELATED AND SUPPLEMENTAL INSTRUCTION (RSI)

The objective of our examination was to determine if apprentices are progressing on schedule, attending classes, covering the entire course of study, and to ensure the programs are maintaining accurate records with adequate systems in place to provide training.

The program has Related and Supplemental Instruction (RSI) and is using the San Diego Community College District as their Local Education Agency (LEA). The course outlines as written by the Programs have been reviewed and approved by the school.

Apprentices are required to attend classes twice a week for a total of 180 hours each year.

The audit team visited the classroom and lab facilities and found them more than adequate to train apprentices. ABC employs 19 part-time instructors and a full time training facilities manager.

(a) Findings

- (1) Apprentices records show that RSI is tracked and maintained in a computer data base and reviewed on a regular basis. Individual files contained computer printouts of completed course work including grades and attendance records. In addition to the compilation records, individual grade slips for each class were included in the files.

(b) Recommendation

- (1) Explore and continue to provide updates to the program and apprentice(s) on how the apprentice(s) is progressing in their required educational courses. Review curriculum and develop new courses to cover additional needs when needed.

Section XVI of the program's standards, Section 3073.2, 3078(d), of the California Labor Code, and Section 205(e)(h), 212(a)(3)(6)(7) (c)(13)(14) of the California Code of Regulations states that it is recommended that the program provide a minimum of 144 hours per year of supplemental instruction for each year of apprenticeship and adequate arrangements for related and supplemental instruction, and have the ability and commitment to train apprentices with current industry standard criteria.

6. TRAINING CENTER

The objective is to ensure the program has adequate facilities, tools, materials and equipment to train apprentices, and to determine if the facilities are utilized and adequate for training.

The ABC training facility is new (2004) and features state-of-the art classrooms and a large hands-on lab facility. Crafts work side by side in a large open bay atmosphere which can accommodate several projects at one time. Training modules and equipment are mounted on wheels and can be moved to allow flexibility. There is also an area which allows crafts to work together on integrated projects which more realistically simulate a real construction site. Instruction is conducted with good health and safety practices in mind.

(a) Findings

- (1) The facilities are more than adequate to accommodate Apprentice training.

(b) Recommendation

- (1) The program should continue current practices and insure plans for growth are based upon the current successful model.

Section 3074 of the California Labor Code—Section 212(a) (3) (4) (8), (c) (13) (12), 212.3 of the California Code of Regulations states that the program sponsor must have adequate arrangements for related and supplemental instruction.

7. MECHANISM TO KEEP APPRENTICES REASONABLY EMPLOYED

Our objective is to determine if apprentices are kept reasonably employed, to ensure the program has adequate systems in place to rotate apprentices so they cover all work processes, and to provide apprentices with continuing employment in the event of a layoff.

The apprenticeship programs keep the apprentices reasonably by providing an out of work list. When apprentices become unemployed they contact staff and are placed on the list. The employers call in and request apprentices and apprentices are dispatched from the list in numerical sequence. Staff contacts the apprentice by phone and gives them the name and contact number of the prospective employer. If staff does not hear from the apprentice or employer within a few days of the interview, a follow up phone call is made to the employer. If the apprentice has not contacted the employer or failed to show for the interview staff contacts the apprentice and if necessary cites them to appear before the Committee. If the apprentice is interviewed but not hired by the employer, he/she remains in rotation on the out of work list and is dispatched again. ABC staff works diligently with apprentices to ensure that all parties are fulfilling their obligations. There is no formal system to rotate apprentices from one employer to another employer. Apprentices are counseled on the importance of being signed up on the out of work list when they become unemployed. If they fail to report after they become unemployed they are cited to appear before the Committee.

(a) Findings

- (1) The review found the program has an established system to keep apprentices reasonably employed and to provide them with continuing employment in the event of a layoff.
- (2) The records found the referral/dispatch system keeps the apprentices employed within their industry.

(b) Recommendation

- (1) The program should continue the system they have in place and encourage additional employer involvement.

Section 3080 of the Labor Code, and Section 212 (b) (7) (9), (c) (16) (18) of the California Code of Regulations. The program(s) must have a mechanism to keep apprentices reasonably employed and maintain accurate documentation Section 3080 of the Labor Code, and Section 212 (b) (7) (9), (c) (16) (18) of the California Code of Regulations.

8. JOB SITE VISIT

A review of the job site offers an opportunity to view a job in progress, observe the work that is being done, and allows us to discuss the operation of the program with the apprentice. It enables direct contact with the apprentice to determine the following:

- If the apprentice is performing the various task listed within the work processes of their trade.
- If advancements are made on schedule.
- If the apprentice is receiving the correct pay and benefits.
- If the apprentice is kept employed on a reasonably continuous basis.
- If the programs' mechanism to keep apprentices reasonably employed is adequate.

A job site visit was conducted on September 5, 2007. Two job sites were selected, the Encinas Wastewater Treatment Plant located at 6200 Avenida Encinas in Carlsbad and Cesar Chavez Middle School located on the corner of Frazee and Oleander in Oceanside, Ca. Two electrical Apprentices employed by Rock Electric were interviewed at the Encinas Wastewater Plant and one plumbing and one sheet metal apprentice, both employed by Davis Mechanical were interviewed at the middle school. During the interview it was determined that he had the apprentices working within the scope of the trade and that the apprentices were supervised and working under the direction of qualified journeymen. Based upon the job-site visit we can make the following conclusions:

- The apprentices are receiving the proper pay and benefits.
- Adequate tools and materials were available at the work site to train the apprentices.
- There was a proper ratio of Journeyman to Apprentices and adequate supervision.

(a) Findings

- (1) Only one apprentice had his OJT record sheet with them at the time of the interview. The other three stated that they had OJT sheets at home and were logging in their hours and work training either daily, weekly or monthly. All the interviewed apprentices said they had been lax about turning in their hours during the summer.

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Ensure that the apprentices are correctly tracking and recording their OJT hours and submitting them in accordance with the rules and regulations.
 - (2) Continue citing apprentices who do not follow the rules and regulations regarding OJT hours.
-

Section 208, 212(a) (1) (2) (4), (b) (4) (5) (6), (c) (6) (13) (14) of the California Code of Regulations states that all on-the-job training will be performed by journeymen, that all related and supplemental instruction required by the apprenticeship standards will be provided, that all work processes in the apprenticeship standards are being covered, and that graduates have completed the apprenticeship program's requirements.

9. SELF-ASSESSMENT REVIEW AND PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN

The objective is to determine if the program has submitted the annual Self-Assessment Review and Program Improvement Plan. The California Code of Regulations Title 8, Section 212.3 requires programs to perform an annual self-evaluation and to create an improvement plan. The DAS now requires that each program submit a copy of their Annual Self-Assessment Review and Program Improvement Plan to their apprenticeship consultant by December 1 of each year.

(a) Findings

- (1) The required annual Self-Assessment Review and Program Improvement Plans for 2006 was submitted on Nov. 27, 2006. The DAS has sent reminders to the programs for the 2007 assessments due again by December 1, 2007.

(b) Recommendations

- (2) Use the Self-Assessment and Program Improvement Plan as a tool for setting program goals and adapt the listed changes during the previous 12 month period.

Section 212 (a) (6) (7), (c) (2) (11), 212.3 of the California Code of Regulations states that the program sponsor must submit annually a Self-Assessment Review and Program Improvement Plan to the DAS.

10. COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND MINUTES OF MEETING

Each of the Committees audited consist of seven members who are selected by and represent the signatory employer associations. Each committee also includes a consultant representing the Division of Apprenticeship Standards and an advisor from the local school district. The apprenticeship consultant and school advisor act without a vote. This committee is responsible for administering the Standards for this program. In carrying out its functions, the committee has certain authority under the law. The actions, therefore, must be in accordance with approved apprenticeship standards and should be recorded in the minutes. Each program also has a separate advisory committee comprised of employer and apprentice representatives.

The objective is to determine if the apprenticeship committee is meeting on a regular basis, documenting actions, discussing and reviewing apprenticeship records, and making appropriate assessments and evaluations.

(a) Findings

- (1) The Committees meet monthly and maintain well documented and detailed minutes of meetings that contain, among other things: cancellations and completions, advancements, disciplines, reports of consultants, credit for previous experience, and other actions pertaining to apprenticeship business.

An extensive agenda is prepared for each meeting complete with supporting documents for each item.

If an apprentices is on the agenda for a rules and regulations violation, a complete record of their RSI grades and hours and OJT hours is provided to the Committee.

(b) Recommendations

- (1) Continue with the monthly meetings and the exceptional documentation.

Section 3076, 3080(b), 3078(d)(f), 3079, 3093(k), of the California Labor Code, and Section 213, 218, 212(7), 208(5), 205(e)(f)(g)(i), 212(c)(1)(6) (9), 224 of the California Code of Regulations states that the program sponsor must maintain adequate documentation and records.

11. COMMENTS FROM PROGRAM SPONSOR

Comments, if submitted by the program sponsor during the 14-day review and comment period, will be included with this report to the Chief of DAS and ultimately to the California Apprenticeship Council.

12. CORRECTIONS AND TIMELINE

The audit findings and recommendations are set forth in this report. The program has 14 days from the receipt of this report to review and submit comments on the report.

Within 10-days following the receipt of comments or the completion of the comment period, a final report will be submitted by the Chief of DAS to the California Apprenticeship Council.

The final report will detail the findings with recommendations for remedial actions. The programs must remedy all deficiencies and be in full compliance with their apprenticeship standards. The programs must notify the DAS in writing when deficiencies have been remedied. A DAS representative will schedule an appointment to review the completion of the remedial actions. Failure to comply may be grounds for withdrawing state approval of the apprenticeship programs.

13. REMARKS

The results of this audit do not modify, replace or negate other duties and requirements or any previous notices you may have received regarding the fulfilling of your obligations prior to or after the audit period. In addition, law changes or new rulings might result in different findings in future audits.

Respectfully submitted by,

Karen Belcher

10-18-07

Karen Belcher
Apprenticeship Consultant
DAS, San Diego District Office

Date



San Diego Apprenticeship Training Trust

October 17, 2007

Ms. Karen Belcher
Department of Industrial Relations
Division of Apprenticeship Standards
7575 Metropolitan Drive, Suite 209
San Diego, CA 92108-4424

Dear Ms. Belcher:

We are obviously very well pleased with the findings in your August, 2007 audit that recognize the ABC San Diego Sheet Metal, Plumbing/Pipefitting and Electrical apprenticeship programs as "exemplary".

The ABC Training staff, committee members, and contractors work diligently as a team to consistently maintain quality apprenticeship programs in keeping with DAS and committee rules and regulations. San Diego ABC is committed to training skilled and well educated craftworkers to meet the ever changing needs of the industry. It is certainly rewarding to have the quality of our program and the professionalism of our staff recognized and validated by the Division of Apprenticeship Standards.

The ABC staff and committee members look forward to working with you in continuing to train the construction workforce of the future.

Respectfully,

SAN DIEGO ABC APPRENTICESHIP TRAINING TRUST

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "T. Barrett".

Tracey Barrett
Director of Education

RECEIVED
DAS RECORDS SECTION
SAN FRANCISCO
07 OCT 31 PM 1:31